

1 Kaitlyn E. Luther, Esq. (*Pro Hac Vice*)
2 kluther@cmn-law.com
3 CHITTENDEN, MURDAY & NOVOTNY, LLC
4 303 W. Madison, Suite 1400
Chicago, Illinois 60606
TEL: (312) 281-3600
FAX: (312) 281-3678

5 Madison S. Spach, Jr. (SBN 94405)
6 mspach@sclawfirm.com
7 Amanda L. Voivedich (SBN 271470)
8 alvoivedich@sclawfirm.com
9 Shaheen E. Etemadi (SBN 319138)
10 setmadi@sclawfirm.com
SPACH, CAPALDI & WAGGMAN, LLP 4675
MacArthur Court, Suite 550
Newport Beach, California 92660
Telephone: (949) 852-0710
Facsimile: (949) 852-0714

11 Attorneys for Plaintiff and Counter-Defendant
12 NORTH AMERICAN COMPANY FOR
LIFE AND HEALTH INSURANCE

13 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
14 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

15 NORTH AMERICAN COMPANY) Case No. 5:18-cv-01421-JGB-SP
16 FOR LIFE AND HEALTH)
INSURANCE,) PROTECTIVE ORDER

17 Plaintiff,)

18 v.)

19 KIM THO THI NGUYEN, an)
individual; MAI XUAN LAM, an)
20 individual,)

21 Defendants.)

22 KIM THO THI NGUYEN, an)
23 individual; MAI XUAN LAM, an)
individual,)

24 Counter-Complainants,)

25 v.)

26 PHIL QUOC LE, an individual;)
27 NORTH AMERICAN COMPANY)
FOR LIFE AND HEALTH)
28 INSURANCE, An Iowa)

1 Corporation; and DOES 1 to 10,)
2 Inclusive,)
3 Counter-Defendants.

4 1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

5 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,
6 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure
7 and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted.
8 Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the
9 following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does
10 not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that
11 the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited
12 information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable
13 legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below,
14 that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential
15 information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be
16 followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from
17 the court to file material under seal.

18 B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

19 This action is likely to involve trade secrets, customer and pricing lists and
20 other valuable research, development, commercial, financial, technical and/or
21 proprietary information for which special protection from public disclosure and from
22 use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such
23 confidential and proprietary materials and information consist of, among other things,
24 confidential business or financial information, information regarding confidential
25 business practices, or other confidential research, development, or commercial
26 information (including information implicating privacy rights of third parties),
27 information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged
28

1 or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case
2 decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to
3 facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials,
4 to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to
5 ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in
6 preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the
7 litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is
8 justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be
9 designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated
10 without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public
11 manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this
12 case.

13 2. DEFINITIONS

14 2.1 Action: North American Company for Life and Health Insurance v. Kim
15 Tho Thi Nguyen and Mai Xuan Lam, et al.; United States District Court for the
16 Central District of California, Case No. 5:18-cv-01421-JGB-SP.

17 2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of
18 information or items under this Order.

19 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how
20 it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection
21 under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good
22 Cause Statement.

23 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their
24 support staff).

25 2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or
26 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
27 “CONFIDENTIAL.”
28

1 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of
2 the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
3 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or
4 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

5 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
6 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as
7 an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

8 2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
9 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
10 counsel.

11 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or
12 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

13 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to
14 this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have
15 appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which
16 has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

17 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
18 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
19 support staffs).

20 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
21 Discovery Material in this Action.

22 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support
23 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
24 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
25 and their employees and subcontractors.

26 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
27 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”
28

1 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
2 from a Producing Party.

3 3. SCOPE

4 The protections conferred by this Order cover not only Protected Material (as
5 defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected
6 Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material;
7 and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that
8 might reveal Protected Material.

9 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the
10 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

11 4. DURATION

12 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
13 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees
14 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be
15 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with
16 or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and
17 exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action,
18 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time
19 pursuant to applicable law.

20 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

21 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each
22 Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this
23 Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies
24 under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection
25 only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that
26 qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications
27 for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of
28 this Order.

1 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
2 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
3 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose
4 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating Party
5 to sanctions.

6 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
7 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
8 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

9 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this
10 Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated
11 or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this
12 Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

13 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

14 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents,
15 but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the
16 Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter
17 "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that contains protected material. If only a
18 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing
19 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate
20 markings in the margins).

21 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
22 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
23 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before
24 the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed
25 "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants
26 copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or
27 portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the
28 specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the "CONFIDENTIAL legend"

1 to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the
2 material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
3 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the
4 margins).

5 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify the
6 Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition all
7 protected testimony.

8 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any
9 other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior
10 of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend
11 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information warrants
12 protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected
13 portion(s).

14 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure
15 to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the
16 Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
17 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
18 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
19 Order.

20 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

21 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation
22 of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s Scheduling Order.

23 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution
24 process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

25 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the
26 Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose
27 (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may
28 expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived

1 or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the
2 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing
3 Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

4 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

5 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
6 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
7 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
8 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
9 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving
10 Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

11 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
12 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
13 authorized under this Order.

14 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless otherwise
15 ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving
16 Party may disclose any information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

17 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well as
18 employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to
19 disclose the information for this Action;

20 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the
21 Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

22 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure
23 is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the "Acknowledgment
24 and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

25 (d) the court and its personnel;

26 (e) court reporters and their staff;

1 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional Vendors
2 to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
3 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

4 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
5 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

6 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the
7 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party
8 requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit 1 hereto; and (2) they will
9 not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the
10 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise
11 agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed
12 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be
13 separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as
14 permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

15 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually
16 agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

17
18 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN
19 OTHER LITIGATION

20 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
21 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as
22 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

23 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall
24 include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

25 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to
26 issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena
27 or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of
28 this Stipulated Protective Order; and

1 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by
2 the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

3 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
4 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action
5 as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena
6 or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The
7 Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court
8 of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as
9 authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful
10 directive from another court.

11 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE
12 PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

13 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-
14 Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information
15 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
16 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
17 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

18 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce
19 a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an
20 agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s confidential
21 information, then the Party shall:

- 22 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that
23 some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality
24 agreement with a Non-Party;
25 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective
26 Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably
27 specific description of the information requested; and
28

1 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-
2 Party, if requested.

3 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14
4 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may
5 produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request.
6 If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce
7 any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality
8 agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court
9 order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
10 protection in this court of its Protected Material.

11 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

12 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
13 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
14 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in
15 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts
16 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or
17 persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order,
18 and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and
19 Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

20 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE
21 PROTECTED MATERIAL

22 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
23 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection,
24 the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil
25 Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure
26 may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior
27 privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the
28 parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or

1 information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the
2 parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted
3 to the court.

4 12. MISCELLANEOUS

5 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
6 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

7 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
8 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
9 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
10 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any
11 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

12 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
13 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may
14 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific
15 Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is
16 denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public
17 record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

18 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

19 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60
20 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return
21 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this
22 subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,
23 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
24 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party
25 must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person
26 or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by
27 category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed
28 and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts,

1 compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the
2 Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an
3 archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing
4 transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert
5 reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such
6 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or
7 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in
8 Section 4 (DURATION).

9 14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all
10 appropriate measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or
11 monetary sanctions.

12
13 IT IS SO ORDERED.

14
15 DATED: February 22, 2019



Sheri Pym

U.S. Magistrate Judge

1 EXHIBIT A

2 ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

3 I, _____ [print or type full name], of

4 _____
5 [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its
6 entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United
7 States District Court for the Central District of California on _____
8 [date] in the case of North American Company for Life and Health Insurance v. Kim
9 Tho Thi Nguyen and Mai Xuan Lam, et al., Case No. 5:18-cv-01421-JGB-SP. I agree
10 to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order
11 and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to
12 sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will
13 not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated
14 Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the
15 provisions of this Order.

16 I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court
17 for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
18 Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
19 termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____ [print or
20 type full name] of _____ [print or type full
21 address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in
22 connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this
23 Stipulated Protective Order.

24 Date: _____

25 City and State where sworn and signed: _____

26 Printed name: _____

27
28 Signature: _____